SWORWIB QUARTERLY BOARD MEETING  
OhioMeansJobs Center  
November 13, 2014 • 8:00 a.m.  
Minutes

**SWORWIB Members Present:** Julia Abell, Douglas Arthur, Carla Chance, Michael Conner, Chad Day, Timothy Devine, Margaret Fox, Sanscorro Frazior, Natalie Galbato, Crystal German, Sharon Hancock, Shawn Harter, Laurence Jones, Mike Kelly, Joseph Kramer, Andrew Lotter, Paul Magnus, Kathy Maybriar, René McPhedran, Gregg Oshita, Terry Phillips, Kevin Powell, Eric Riddick, Dan Ripberger, Gwen Robinson, Jennifer Roeder, William Rutz, Harry Snyder, Carol Sorenson-Williams, Mark Stoebel, Tyrone Stuckey, Amy Tanaka, Robin Throckmorton, Greg Toebbe, Karen Wessel, Beverly Williams, George Wilson, Pamela Wilson, Charles Wright, Steve Yancey, Allen Zink.

**SWORWIB Members Absent:** West Africa, Steve Browne, Jay Alvaro, Tracy Burnett, Jack Cameron, April Gillespie, Jennifer Graff, Betsy Harris, Gail Holloman, Gregory Johnson, Maggie Lund, Tim McCartney, Walter McLarty, Chris Monzel, Trish Nash, Ruth Nkrumah-Martey, Dee Dee Miller, Johnmark Ouderluys, Eric Rademacher, Safi W. Safi, Doug Sizemore, Barry Strum, Brian Thomas, Alicia Tidwell, Christopher Young.

**SWORWIB Staff:** Sherry Kelley Marshall, Tamara Nared, Cheryl Brueggeman, Wesley Miller.

**Resources:** Kathleen Busemeyer, Timothy Dingler, Brandy Scott-Hermann, Kevin Holt, Lynn Murphy.

**Guests:** Gina Bell (for Chris Monzel), Benita Spraggins, Kate Lindsey, Jane Keller, Chellie McClellan.

I. **Opening – Welcome and Introductions**  
Having exceeded quorum, Chair Powell opened the November 13, 2014 Quarterly Board Meeting at 8:00 a.m., thanking everyone for taking the time out of their busy schedules to attend and requesting that all members and guests introduce themselves and reminding everyone to sign-in at the registration desk as attendance record keeping is required.

**Recognition of New Staff and Departing Board Members:** President Marshall introduced Cheryl Brueggeman as the new Youth Services/Public Information Contractor. Marshall recognized the resigning board members whose terms complete at December 15, 2014: Tracy Burnett, Jack Cameron, Jose Chavez, Dwendolyn Chester, Lisa Cordova, Dayle Dearduff, Brenda Gumbs, Gail Holloman, Derek Jackson, Mike Kelly, Maggie Lund, Walter McLarty, Ricardo Moncado, Debra Rainer, Doug Sizemore, Brian Thomas, Todd Uterstaedt, and Steve Yancey. Mike Kelly was congratulated for his long service both as a board member and officer. Steve Yancey was recognized for his service and encouraged to assist with continued engagement with the one-stop center and active recruitment for a new Kroger HR nominee.

II. **Approval of the Agenda**  
Chair Powell reviewed the agenda and reminded members that the consent agenda is used by larger boards to handle the business of the organization in an efficient fashion in order to have time to focus on essential discussions. The practice is that everyone reviews the entire agenda before approval including a close review of the consent agenda and then indicates during the “Approval of the Agenda” any consent agenda item they wish to move from the consent agenda to “Other Business” for separate discussion. There being no agenda corrections noted or requests for agenda changes, Snyder moved, Rutz seconded a motion that the agenda be approved as previously distributed. Motion passed unanimously.

III. **Consent Agenda**  
Chair Powell called for a motion to approve the consent agenda items. There being no corrections, additions or requests for separate discussion about items on the consent agenda, Jones moved, Ripberger seconded a motion to approve the consent agenda noting the resignation additions provided by Marshall. Motion passed unanimously. The following materials provided in the board packet were therefore approved:
   - 8/14/2014 Quarterly Meeting Minutes
   - 2015 Calendar of Meetings
   - Chair’s Report
   - President Report

11.13.2014 Quarterly Board Minutes Approved
IV. Nominating Committee Report

Nominating Committee Chair Natalie Galbato reviewed the Committee Report included with the Board packet of materials. Several members who had recently attended meetings with Mayor Cranley shared their experiences with these meetings and varying statements from the Mayor relative to reducing the size of the board and getting members who are heavily involved in programmatic activities which seemed different than the oversight and policy role of the Board since inception. Stoeber asked Marshall about meeting with Mayor Cranley and Marshall advised that she has already met with the County Commissioners and several times with Mayor Cranley soon and would be meeting with him again in December to review the Board’s nomination slate. Various members expressed concern about the Mayor’s express intention to reduce the board; some indicating he had said as low as 20. Marshall shared with the Board that WA and WIOA in the future operates within a “dynamic tension” in and around the large variety of roles by government and the board and required partners and contracted service providers as well as the tension within the community about the optimum ways to improve employment and the competition for who is first among equals in need and expectations of attention. She related the role of the Chief Lead Elected Official (CLEO/CEO) who is Area #13 is the Mayor of the City of Cincinnati relative to key aspects of planning, budgeting, procurement and appointment of the Board. She asked the board members to “ride the wave” of change that is upon us now and for the next couple of years as all the “new things” within the law challenge us to adjust. Stoeber asked Galbato is the list that is before them for a vote is the best recommendation from the SWORWIB and includes the “cushion” of employers and business leaders recommended since 2007. He expressed concern that we are making our clearest and best case to Mayor Cranley because he has heard many different numbers as the objective for board reduction this year. Stoeber further commented that there are a lot of different numbers and we should let the record show that this is the board’s interpretation of the new law’s required number, plus cushion to avoid monitoring findings if we are out of compliance with Board quorum or attendance. Stoeber moved, Jones seconded a motion to forward the slate to Mayor Cranley and for Marshall to work with the Mayor to provide for reduction in numbers but still the robust representation the SWORWIB is known to have. Motion passed unanimously. Powell thanked Galbato for her service leading the Nominating Committee particularly during this time of great change. Several members also indicated that Mayor Cranley has a passion to explore how to reduce the large number of monitoring site visits Area #13 receives and plans to ask the Department of Labor to cooperate more with the Ohio Department of Job and Family Services to reduce the number of monitorings and audits and the extensive time these take away from direct services and productive activities.

V. President’s Report

Chair Powell asked Marshall to present on the agenda items included under the President’s Report.

Questions on President’s Written Report

Marshall asked if there were any questions on her written report and there were none.

SuperAwards Nomination Form

Marshall reviewed the nomination form for SuperAwards and asked the members to submit any nominees to her by December 1, 2014. This annual event takes place as part of the Annual Meeting, February 12, 2015.

State Unified Plan
Marshall shared the hearing schedule for the Governor’s State Unified Plan for WIA, ABLE and Perkins funding streams. Governor Kasich is one of a handful of Governors across the country who are aggressively moving to combine workforce and education related funding streams in order to better serve the customers rather than the programs. Public hearings are scheduled throughout the state with the one for southwest Ohio already held yesterday on 11/12 and well attended by southwest Ohio agencies.

MOU One-Year Amendment
Marshall reported that with the new legislation, WIOA of 2014, phasing in for implementation through 2015 and 2016, WIBs across the state and the Ohio Department of Job and Family Services recognize the advantages of extending existing One-Stop Cost Sharing Memoranda of Agreement that end 6/30/2015 another year until 6/30/2015 and containing costs to the original second year budget. Marshall asked for discussion on the merits of our area extending our current two-year MOU to 6/30/2015 with the cost remaining the same as noted previously. Ripberger moved, Day seconded a motion to extend the current MOU another year. During discussion Robinson expressed concerns about being expected to support the one-stop through the MOU when her status as a required partner for the Board has changed and she feels that she doesn’t have a voice. Magnus noted that elsewhere in the State, other required partners who were formerly on the boards as well as mandated to cost share for the one-stop are concerned; although WIOA has eliminated financial expectations for the funding stream that Mature Services manages. Marshall replied that she can understand the concerns of those who were formally removed as required partners for the boards nationally but are nonetheless mandated to be one-stop partners and cost-share on the infrastructure of the WIA one-stop centers throughout the country. After additional discussion about the implications of Congressional action and the new law, Ripberger asked if the Chair would call the question. Motion passed with Robinson opposing the motion.

Annual Report
Marshall discussed options for handling the production of an Annual Report for the SWORWIB over the next 20-3 years. With the number of staff changes in 2014, and the passage of WIOA with implementation of the new law in 2015 and 2016, she asked the Board to support considerations of options for combining two years if that would be beneficial both to available work schedules and the budget since the SWORWIB is underwriting $200,000 dollars of its own reserves in order to provide administrative dollars to be deployed for supportive services at the OMJ Center through June 2015. Some members felt it was important to summarize the SWORWIB’s results in an annual report and to have an annual report for submission to Dun & Bradstreet, City Council and the Hamilton County Commissioners as well as for fundraising, but perhaps costs could be contained with less glossy printing and paper and more of an on-line delivery. We have also printed marketing materials with the rebranding dollars provided to us at the end of June 2014, so there are some quality materials being used by the OMJ Center and the SWORWIB. German encouraged the SWORWIB to commit to annual reports for marketing, fundraising and public information sharing. The consensus of the Board was for Marshall to decide when it might be prudent to produce a combined years Two Year Report vs. annual presentations. Marshall thanked the members for their support for the Annual Report and encouraged any of the companies that have in-house publication units to consider supporting the SWORWIB Annual Report when possible.

OMJ Modified Performance Measures
Marshall reported on the recent years of budget reductions that have most negatively impacted our area given our improving economy and unemployment rate. This has resulted in another 4% funding reduction atop the 30% total reduction of the last two years. Add to these budget challenges the fact that not all WIAs funding will need to be expended at June 30, 2015 as part of the sunset/closeout of WIA and opening implementation of the new WIOA law for which there is still not a federal budget approved. She has worked with the OMJ Center to apply for special funds for Transition Centers for plant closings, to cover the costs of two staff persons to work with dislocated workers and various other special training initiatives aligned with our Industry Sector priorities. These are some of the reasons why the Executive Committee approved the use of SWORWIB $200,000 in SWORWIB reserves for supportive services at the OMJ Center. Marshall advised that the State distribution formula for how WIA funds coming into Ohio gets dispersed to the local areas was designed in 1998 and she has worked with other Metro areas who received disparate impact with funding cuts to change the distribution formula. An amended formula is part of the Ohio State Plan. Holt reported that 78% of the funding goes to direct services, i.e. tuition, wage reimbursement, supportive services. There is a great effort given to reach the local performance goals while funds go up and down. Marshall also indicated that we are in for a roller-coaster cycle with the closing of one law and opening of another and during the development of federal regulation for implementation of the new law, as well as new staff, new office, new technology, new elected officials, etc. Consequently, we want to hold the OMJ Center to the most meaningful performance measures and convert the other measures away from goals into data points.
One-Stop Request for Proposal Highlights/Attorney Engagement Letter

Marshall reported that Hamilton County will continue to run the One Stop Center and the WIB has to assume responsibility for issuing the Request for Proposals for operations of the OMJ Center under WIOA. Marshall reported she cannot manage this additional work load given her current workload and is hoping for some support from ODJFS since all the one-stop procurement is identified under the newly passed WIOA law. McPhedran reported that she had connected the SWORWIB to the new Pro Bono Partnership of Greater Cincinnati who had obtained cooperation from Taft Law to assist with procurement services to get moving on issuing the RFP sooner rather than wait on the State’s plans for statewide re-procurement. There may still be some expenses associated with the SWORWIB managing this procurement process, but the pro bono services are estimated to be extensive. Marshall thanked McPhedran for her leadership and members gave a round of applause for her efforts. Harter asked if there is a cap on attorney fees and if another year can be added. Marshall replied that there is not a cap and that she will ask Taft to review. Ripberger asked if there is any agreement from Taft – are they committed at this time. Marshall replied, yes, they have sent us a letter committing their services. Conner spoke to the importance of our having this kind of legal support to conduct this process as there were some challenges with the process and scheduling of the prior procurement for one-stop services. Kelly moved, German seconded a motion to authorize Marshall to sign the engagement letter for Pro Bono services from TAFT as part of the Pro Bono Partnership of Greater Cincinnati assistance. Motion passed unanimously.

ETP Approval Update

Marshall reviewed the annual process of obtaining performance results reporting from the Eligible Training Providers (ETPs) approved to receive Individual Training Accounts (ITA funds) from Area #13. The SWORWIB is one of only a few Workforce Boards who conduct an annual performance evaluation of ETPs rather than provide no evaluation on completion, employment, wages and credentials obtained with the public’s investment. Marshall advised that training for some jobs has increased the average wages from $9.00 an hour to $12 dollars or more an hour in sector-approved industries and in-demand occupations. At the time the board packet was sent, Cincinnati State was not listed as an approved training provider and we had not been able to meet with met with Cincinnati State until after the Board packet had been released. In the meeting, CSTCC demonstrated dramatic improvement and more success since their corrective action plan was created last year. The report has been amended and Cincinnati State has since been approved. New Horizons had varying performance. Their entry level wage is $7/hour. Some made $28-$29/hour but many were low wage. Moreover New Horizons charges the same fee for almost all trainings and the fee matches the local area maximum for the SWORWIB and also matches the local area maximum for Area #12 which is three times the amount for our area. Marshall has recommended provisional status so we can explore the variations and seek an action plan for more steady performance and justifiable pricing practices. The SWORWIB ETP and ITA policies are summarized on-line is a section labeled Training Provider Criteria and we have been engaged in a continuous improvement process with ETP evaluation since 2008.

Marshall further elaborated that the SWORWIB’s significantly influenced the evaluation of ETPs under the new WIOA of 2014. Other aspects of the SWORWIB’s process were also embraced in the new law such as “informed customer choice”, inclusion of industry sector priorities; focus on in-demand occupations and industries and evaluation of providers for completion, employment, wage and credentials. Moreover, under the new WIOA of 2014, all WIBs have not only do the level of evaluation the SWORWIB has developed but are also required to evaluate the results comparatively for all others (regardless of funding source) in the same program as those we invest WIOA dollars in. Additionally, WIBs are required to post the evaluation results and the comparable evaluation results for public review and scrutiny.

Marshall requested Board members who are interested in training providers and evaluation results to volunteer to serve on the ETP Evaluation Committee which will get started in August 2015 to be ready for the annual evaluation process. Business representatives are especially encouraged to join the committee. Arthur asked who is reporting the data now to which Marshall replied that colleges are evaluated annually in US News and World Report but training providers are not all colleges. She also noted that Congress only worked and passed the WIOA of 2014 in 2014 and has been struggling with Perkins, Pell and the Higher Education Act because of issues with open college access but deplorable completion rates and high student debt, so she learned from a congressional staffer that WIOA was a chance to move towards training provider evaluation and many felt the Workforce Boards needed to help with this public policy challenge; hence the new requirements for comparative analysis and public disclosure. Harter suggested that accredited educational institutes are also subject to other accreditation standards. Snyder reported that Great Oaks reports success posting their placement results for accreditation to continue to receive the

11.13.2014 Quarterly Board Minutes Approved
federal funds for training. Marshall advised that we will still need to look for discrepancies in the data being reported. Toebbe moved, Harter seconded a motion to accept the Eligible Training Provider List as presented. Motion passed unanimously.

Office and Technology Update
Marshall thanked Greg Toebbe for putting the SWORWIB on “the iCloud” and obtaining cost coverage to make this transition. However, it is not an easy adjustment so Marshall apologized for the many efforts made to deliver the November board packet electronically by moving to “the cloud”. She expressed hope that the February packet should be released and received more smoothly. Marshall also thanked the Cincinnati USA Regional Chamber, ISOCNET and TechSoft for their assistance with the IT changes, as well as Harry Snyder for the office space and reproduction services at the SWORWIB’s new offices located at Great Oaks, Scarlet Oaks, Instructional Resource Center. There have been some problems establishing the www.SWORWIB.org website so Marshall asked everyone to be patient but also call her if they go on line and the website is “empty” again. Marshall reported that the SWORWIB office at Great Oaks will be disrupted to have cubicles set-up over the holiday break which means that she may not be able to take her planned vacation. She suggested that members call her cell phone to reach her during this time as she may not have access to office phones or email. An Open House is being planned for January 2015.

Distribution of New Marketing Materials
Marshall reviewed the marketing packet that was distributed noting that we have adopted the OMJ branding with these materials.

VI. Presentation: On the Job Training
Holt introduced Brandy Scott-Hermann and Kathleen Busemeyer who explained the “On the Job Training” (OJTs) account and activities of the OMJ Center team in promoting these training opportunities to employers and job seekers. Maybriar noted that the OJT account is an incentive to hire workers who need some additional training that is central to the business operations and to reimburse the employer for their consideration of this candidate and training in the workplace rather than waiting for the individual to get some additional education that may or may not be useful for the particular job duties. Holt noted that some think of this training approach as a form of corporate welfare but nationally this kind of direct work experience under the tutelage of the employer has been very effective for retention and advancement by job seekers. Scott Hermann noted that only a few of the current employer board members had explored OJTs as a way to recruit from among the OMJ Center jobseeker base and support an individual to learn while working with the employer getting a wage subsidy since the new employee needed hands-on learning and work experience in the early months of employment. Powell noted that the information was interesting but where are the metrics about number of employers, kinds of industries, and wages. Stuckey asked about the average age for this kind of work experience training and how many young adults are benefitting from this kind of mentorship approach that helps them to bond more to a job and hopefully become more successful. German asked about the size of the companies that use the OJT training approach as part of their workforce recruitment and whether there were efforts to encourage small business and minority owners to utilize this recruitment and training approach. Pamela Wilson further asked about gender statistics and whether this tool is used for both female and male candidates for job related training plans. Other board members had similar concerns about the absence of metric data for something this compelling as a product of the OMJ Center. Marshall agreed to work with the OMJ Center and ODJFS which also offers similar paid on-the-job training programs such as OJT State Accounts and Ohio Earn to Learn to obtain some statistics on the jobseeking population age, gender, race and employer company size and industry, gender, as well as wage ranges and average wages across all OJTs. She will then send this information to Board members in a separate email communication only about the OJT metrics.

VII. Presentation: Youth Services Report and Request for Proposal
Tim Dingler presented the Youth Service Report and a status update on our service providers at November, 2014 with seven more months on the current contracts and answered questions from the board members about individual service provider performance results and percentage of funds remaining for services through the end of WIA at June 30, 2015. Cheryl Brueggeman quickly presented the framework for the Request for Proposals for WIOA Youth Services so contracts can be undertaken for a July 1, 2015 effective start date under the new WIOA requirements for 75% funding for out-of-school youth and 25% funding for in-school youth. She also invited any other Board members who wanted to participate on the RFP Evaluation Committee to let her know as the scheduling of meetings would be getting underway shortly after the Board’s approval of the RFP framework with hopefully a recommendation from the Youth RFP Evaluation Committee hopefully by the Annual Meeting; otherwise the recommendation will be presented for confirmation at the March Executive Committee meeting. The RFP will
be released to registered interested service providers and will be posted on line at the HCJFS RFP site of their website. Ripberger moved, Stuckey seconded a motion to approve Youth Services RFP Framework and move for the RFP to be released as soon as possible. Motion passed unanimously.

VIII. Presentation: What's Coming with WIOA?
Due to the energetic engagement in the first two presentations, Marshall recommended that this presentation be moved to the February Annual Meeting and John Weber of the State Office of Workforce Development be invited to present from the State's perspective. Conner moved, Kelly seconded a motion to reschedule the WIOA presentation for the Annual Meeting. Motion passed unanimously.

IX. Other Business
Chair Powell asked for other business to be brought before the Board and there was none at this time.

X. Public Comments and Announcements
Chair Powell asked for announcements or comments from the general public in attendance and there was none at this time.

XI. Next Meetings
Chair Powell reviewed the upcoming meetings though February 2015 as noted on the agenda.

XII. Adjournment
There being no further business, Kelly moved, Riddick seconded a motion to adjourn at 10:05 a.m. Motion passed unanimously.

Respectfully submitted,

René McPhedran  
Secretary